

**EFFECTIVENESS OF EMPOWERMENT PROGRAM: A  
CASE STUDY OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF *ANGGUR  
MERAH* PROGRAM IN BORONUBAEN AND HAUTEAS  
VILLAGES, TIMOR TENGAH UTARA DISTRICT**

**Yanuaris Makun Tnobi<sup>1</sup>**

---

**ABSTRACT**

This study aimed to identify the effectiveness of the implementation of *Anggur Merah*, an empowerment program for poor communities in Boronubaen and Hauteas villages, Timor Tengah Utara district, Indonesia. One-to-one in-depth interviews were used to collect the data from the study participants recruited using purposive sampling technique. Thematic data analysis was guided by a qualitative data analysis framework. The results indicated that the implementation of *Anggur Merah* program was started with socialization sessions by the program implementers to introduce the program to the beneficiaries and establish communication with the beneficiaries prior to the program implementation. Understanding the rules and regulations related to the program was also done by the program implementers. Factors including the use of the budget for daily expenses, family needs and the needs of the beneficiaries' children, early sale of cows and buying cows which were not in accordance with the standard, were the hindrances to the effectiveness of the implementation of the program. The findings of the current study indicate the needs for the improvement of the implementation of the program, including the regular support of the implementers, and the development of clear standard which can guide them to implement program.

**Key words: Effectiveness, empowerment program, *Anggur Merah*, Boronubaen and Hauteas villages, Timor Tengah Utara district**

---

<sup>1</sup> **Postgraduate program, Administrative Science, Nusa Cendana University, Kupang Indonesia.**

## INTRODUCTION

Poverty is a major problem in developing countries including Indonesia (1). Poverty in Indonesia is reflected in many aspects including the unavailability of basic needs, and the difficulty of access to jobs. Poverty is a situation where there is an inability to meet basic needs such as food, clothing, housing, education and health (1, 2). Poverty also means not being able to achieve the standard level of living needs or low income or economic level (3). Briefly poverty can be defined as a low standard of living where there is a lack of material in some or a group of people compared to the standard of living prevailing in the society concerned (3). The poverty rate in Indonesia is very high where 27.77 million Indonesian population are categorized as poor people (4). In East Nusa Tenggara province, the percentage of poverty is also very high at 22.01%, and this greatly impedes regional and national development (5). Similarly, in the district of North Central Timor (TTU), the percentage of poverty is 35% (4).

Poverty in the province of East Nusa Tenggara (NTT) is high, especially in rural communities (5). Various programs have been designed and implemented in order to accelerate poverty alleviation in this province. The central government has launched several programs to help less fortunate families (KKM) in various fields and support them to meet their basic needs. These programs include Smart Indonesia Card (Education field), Healthy Indonesia Card (Health field), Hope Family Program (Bantuan Langsung Tunai), PNPM (development and empowerment) and others. NTT Provincial Government has also launched an empowerment program called *Anggur Merah* (Red Wine) Program aimed to help economically disadvantaged or poor people (6, 7). Likewise, the TTU Regency Government has launched a very popular empowerment program called the Sari Tani Program.

These various community empowerment programs are launched by the Government with the aim of creating an established family economic life (8). This means that if the programs are used properly then the expected goal can be achieved. Boronubaen and Hauteas villages were chosen as research sites because the implementation of *Anggur Merah* Program in both villages was not working properly, while the other villages were running normally as directed by the program (7). The development of *Anggur Merah* Independent Village is pursued through fresh fund allocation (Fresh money) to create an advanced and productive village community (7). To optimize the

implementation of development, the program is implemented in a participatory manner, a manifestation of the implementation of economic democracy to a society that is no longer as an object of development but as a development agent.

The interesting thing is that the program or fresh money provided by the Government was not well used well by some of the beneficiaries in North Biboki sub-District. The beneficiary families did not implement the empowerment activity called productive economic activity effectively. This condition will not certainly change the lives of recipient communities into economically viable families as expected in the objectives of this empowerment program. Therefore, this study aimed to explore the effectiveness of the community empowerment program called *Anggur Merah* program implemented in Boronubaen and Hauteas villages, North Biboki sub-District, TTU District.

#### *Anggur Merah Program*

*Anggur Merah* Program is one of the community empowerment programs aimed at reducing the number of poor families in NTT. In the 2011 fiscal year (Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of *Anggur Merah* Independent Village Development Program), the NTT Provincial Government has established a village-based development operational policy that is the Village Development / *Anggur Merah* Independent Village (7). In this program, NTT Provincial Government allocates funds for 287 villages with a value per village of Rp.250.000.000. The objective of this policy is to create progressive and productive village communities (6). The development of *Anggur Merah* Independent Village is implemented in a participatory, transparent and integrated manner by involving all stakeholders through the development of productive economic activities adapted to the characteristics, potential and economic advantages of the targeted village.

The Policy on *Anggur Merah* Independent Village started during the leadership of Governor Frans Lebu Raya and Easton Foenay. Since the beginning of their tenure, they have a commitment to reduce poverty and accelerate development in East Nusa Tenggara province (7). The program is incorporated into the 2009-2013 Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMD) as one of the strategies to achieve the development vision 2009-2013 (6). The empowerment

strategy with the spirit of *Anggur Merah* aims to reduce poverty in East Nusa Tenggara Province. The local government's partisanship to the rural community is reflected in the budget allocation of public spending (direct expenditure) is greater than the cost of the apparatus (7). This is because the governor considers that community empowerment should be prioritized first.

In its implementation, the community is accompanied by Community Assistance Group (PKM) recruited by the government to help solve problems, supervise and manage the funds in accordance with the needs of the communities. The target funding is the villages with the highest percentage of poor households according to the data from the statistics central bureau, and that have relatively low service infrastructure, lack of access to public services, and low human resources.

## METHODS

### *Study Settings*

North Biboki sub-district is a sub-district in TTU District which has 2,532 Heads of Families, 10,865 population (9). Of this number, there are 2,010 (97%) less disadvantaged families. The KKM have mostly received various empowerment assistances launched by the Central and Regional Governments. The types of assistance received by most of the people of North Biboki sub-district are: Hope Family Program (PKH), Smart Indonesia Program, Healthy Indonesia Program, PNPM and *Anggur Merah* Program provided by Provincial Government of NTT (7).

Table 1: Population and Poor Household in North Biboki Sub-district

No	Village Name	No. of Household	No. of Poor Household
1.	Boronubaen	375	264
2.	Hauteas	248	212
3.	Lokomea	238	215
4.	Biloe	327	274
5.	Tualene	458	333
6.	Taunbaen	192	164
7.	Sapaen	178	169

8.	Hauteas Barat	168	111
9.	Taunbaen Timur	168	128
10.	Boronubaen Timur	180	140
<b>11.</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>2.532</b>	<b>2.010</b>

The village of Boronubaen is located in North Biboki Sub-district, TTU District. It covers 28.20 km<sup>2</sup>, has 375 households and 1,747 total populations (9). Most of the inhabitants were farmers. Most of the population graduated from elementary school (345 people), junior high school (227 people), senior high school (271 people), illiterate (87 people) and are drop out (83 people) (9). There were 132 people who have diploma certificate and 116 people graduated from university with bachelor degree. Hauteas village is located in North Biboki Sub-district, North Central TTU District, with a total area of 6.40 km<sup>2</sup>. The village has 248 households and 1,127 total populations. Most of the population graduated elementary school (356 people), junior high school (298 people), high school (91 people), and illiterate (63 people). Most of the inhabitants of this village are farmers (9).

#### *Study Design and Recruitment*

A qualitative inquiry employing one-to-one in-depth interviews was carried out in TTU district in 2017. Participants were recruited using purposive sampling technique (10, 11). They were the beneficiaries of *Anggur Merah* program, the heads of the two villages where the program is implemented.

Interviews were conducted at time and place convenient to each participant. The participants were informed about the aim of the study prior to the interviews. They were also informed that there would be no benefits and consequences if they decide to participate or not to continue their participation during the interview, and that their participation in this study was voluntary allowing them to withdraw their participation during the interviews if they did not feel comfortable. They were also told that data or information they provide during the interview would be confidential and anonymous. A study identification letter and number (e.g. R1, R2....) were assigned for each of them to prevent the possibility to link back the data to any individual in the future. Participants were also advised that ethics approval for this study was obtained from

Nusa Cendana University, Kupang, Indonesia. They signed and returned a written informed consent at the interview day.

### *Data Analysis*

Data collected during the fieldwork were analysed using a qualitative data analysis framework introduced by Ritchie and Spencer (12). This analysis framework required five analysis steps to qualitative data. The first step was familiarisation with the data or transcription. This was done by repeatedly reading and giving comments or labels to the data. The second step was the identification of a thematic framework. In this step, issues and concepts that recurred were written down and a thematic coding was developed. The third step was indexing to the entire data through which open coding and close coding were conducted. The fourth step was charting the data through arrangement of appropriate thematic references in a summary chart. The fifth step was mapping and interpretation through which ideas that made up the themes were examined to see the relationship and association between them (12-15).

## **RESULTS**

### *Program Implementation*

The socialization of the program was delivered to all components of the communities in both villages so that the community members understand the ultimate goal of *Anggur Merah* program. The socialization of the program was attended by the members of the farmer groups and involved all stakeholders in the village, among others, policy makers (Village Heads, Village Consultative Bodies or BPD), stakeholders (community leaders, traditional leaders). The results of this study conducted in the villages of Boronubaen and Hauteas villages showed that stakeholders commented that program implementation began with the introduction of the program and building community understanding of the objectives of the program.

The effort of the East Nusa Tenggara Provincial Government to eradicate poverty was done by establishing a program for the empowerment of the poor known as *Anggur Merah* Program. This empowerment program was implemented based on established mechanisms and technical guidance. The first step of the program was to introduce the program to the communities through

socialization. It aimed to provide a good understanding to the community members about the program itself.

"At first I was approached by the PKM. We discussed and he conveyed the initial stage that we have to carry out which is the socialization of the program to all the people who have joined the farmer groups. To carry out the socialization activities on the program for the people of Hauteas village, I asked the village staff to inform all farmer groups and community leaders in order to participate in the activity on the appointed date. Socialization went well and most of the invited people were present at the village office "(P1).

"As a community leader in the village of Boronubaen I was invited by the village head to attend the socialization of the Red Wine program. As I remember, those present at the time were all farmer groups in the village, community leaders, traditional leaders and village government. It turns out that the program is very good for the communities to develop the economic potential for households according to the potentials that exist in this region. At the time the socialization was submitted by the Socialization Team so that each farmer group made a proposal with the help of PKM. Proposals made concerning what potentials will be developed and according to the ability of group members "(P10).

"We were invited by the village head to participate in the Red Wine socialization, and I informed all of my farmer group members to attend the socialization at the village office. Through the socialization we know that this program is very good, because we will be given business capital assistance. The program is special for small communities for the sake of business development. We are given an understanding of the mechanisms, terms and directions and objectives of the Red Wine program. After participating in the socialization activities, we are assisted by PKM as follow up plans so that all administrative requirements are well prepared" (P5).

Another aspect that was also prepared before the implementation of the Red Wine program is to understand the various rules relating to this program. Some participants noted that they were trying to understand the rules related to this program so that the implementation of the program was in accordance with the rules and did not violate the law. In addition, they also mentioned

that prior to the implementation of this program they sought to build good communication between themselves and with program counterparts:

"Personally, the first thing I have to prepare before the execution of duties as a counselor in the village is to master the rules or technical guidelines (the technical instructions) about the Red Wine program. I think this is important because I will always work with community groups, assist them in the preparation, implementation, evaluation and monitoring of activities. Good communication is needed so that people can participate actively. In addition I must also create a good communication with the village administrations and all the components in the villages to support me as a facilitator in facilitating the implementation of this empowerment program "(P4).

#### *Community Participation*

The study results showed that the communities in both villages were actively involved in the program. Several informants commented that they were involved or participated in the socialization of the Red Wine program as they were glad to get help from the government financially to assist their efforts. This was an attempt by the government to improve the economic life and living standards of the poor in the villages:

"The first time we socialize the program, we have been informed about the purpose of the program. We as a community will get capital assistance to conduct a business in agriculture or livestock. The purpose of the capital assistance is to help us so that we can improve our economic conditions. The business we selected in our group was to raise cows. We chose this business because the food for cattle is still very much in the forest, and we also love to eat the cattle ".

"I am a member of the Red Wine beneficiary group, we raise cows. This business intends to help us so that after selling the cattle, the profits are used as capital for further business" (P5).

#### *Effectiveness of Red Wine Program as an Empowerment Program*



The Red Wine program aimed at empowering the communities economically and to improve the welfare of the communities did not seem to be successful. Some respondents pointed out that they did not succeed in achieving the goals of the program. Funds given to them did not lead to improving their economic life because the implementation of the program did not go well as planned:

"The Red Wine Program is very good because it aims to improve the life of the society. Funds given to us as venture capital should be used properly so we can get high benefits from it. But in reality we are not able to increase the business capital given and even the business capital was used for other needs"(P8).

"We get business capital assistance through this Red Wine program but it seems that we are not able to raise the capital given. We cannot afford to recover the capital we received, and instead we use it for our various needs and therefore our business is not developed "(P9).

The study results showed that there were several factors that hampered the business development of Red Wine program participants. Most respondents commented that factors such as spending the budget given for daily needs, and the purchase of cows that did not comply with predetermined standards, were the main factors causing the failure of their businesses:

"At the beginning of the program all members of the group bought cows. The price of the cows purchased varies depending on where the cows are purchased. Therefore, the size of the cows also differs from one to another. This is why the business of our group failed. The purchase of cattle is not up to standard and in addition many of our group members sell their cows early for various reasons including fears that the cows can die and also to meet other needs "(P7).

"I as the group leader always try to approach the members of the group so they can do the refunds obtained but no one paid because they have used the grants for other purposes. Indeed this is very risky" (P3).

Furthermore, study the reason why the empowerment program failed. Several participants expressed that many of their beneficiaries lacked the commitment to their business.

"In my opinion, the entire group of beneficiaries of the Red Wine in Hauteas and Boronubaen villages did not carry out their business maximally. They understand that the Red Wine Fund is an empowerment fund that must be well managed so that after returning the loan, they already have venture capital from interest earned on previous business and capital. But the commitment is very weak to develop the business capital provided by the government. The work done must be terminated for various reasons for the necessities of lives that have never been fulfilled. For example, they used for the needs of school children and therefore the cattle must be sold before early" (P11).

"All of us in this program should return the fund given but were unable to return it. I have tried to tell them again and again, but not results" (P12).

"The Red Wine Fund should be properly managed as an empowerment fund, but they do not manage it effectively. This shows that people are less aware of their own poverty conditions and this appears in their weak commitment to the business they are doing "(P13).

## DISCUSSION

This study aims to identify the effectiveness of the implementation of the Red Wine program as one of the community empowerment programs in the villages of Boronubaen and Hauteas, TTU regency. The results of this study indicate that the effectiveness of the empowerment program implementation is largely determined by the socialization of the program activities to the program beneficiaries so that they really understand what they should do. The results of this study support the results of several previous studies (16-18), reporting that the success or failure of the implementation of a program is also determined by the socialization of the program to people or communities who will benefit from the program. This is because if the program socialization is done well then those who will participate in the program know well the goals to be achieved through the offered programs and what they need to do to achieve those goals. The results of this study also reported that the understanding of program implementers on the various

rules relating to the program offered greatly determines the effectiveness of the implementation of the program of Red Wine. This is because the program implementers should also explain the various rules governing the empowerment program offered to the communities receiving assistance provided through the program. This is important because by knowing the various rules relating to this program helps them to not violate the rules that can hamper to achieve the goals.

The active participation of the communities in a program is one of the aspects that determine the effectiveness of the implementation of a program. The study found that communities in the villages of Boronubaen and Hauteas participated actively in various activities undertaken by Red Wine program implementers. For example, some communities in both villages took part in the program socialization activities and became beneficiaries of the Red Wine program. The results of this study support some the results of previous research (19, 20), indicating that the success of a program is highly dependent on the active participation of the communities in which the program is implemented. Communities are program implementers and are an important part of a program and therefore their participation is crucial to running the program (21). However, the results of this study indicate that the active participation of the communities in both villages has no positive impact on the effectiveness of the program. One indication found in the study is that those who receive grants or start-up capital from the program to do business are not able to recover the capital they have received. The rules relating to the program state that all community members who receive the grants for the enterprise should return it. Some of the reasons found to be the basis of why these programs did not improve their economic conditions or were ineffective were that the efforts made by beneficiaries were unsustainable. This is because the initial capital received by community members in both villages is used to meet various needs of life including the needs of the families and children of the recipients of the initial capital fund.

This study also reports that the purchase of cows that are not in accordance with predetermined standards is one of the factors supporting the ineffectiveness of the program in improving the living standard of society economically. For example, some members of the business group bought big cattle, while other members bought small cattle. As a result cows purchased have different prices and are sold early and sales proceeds are used for various family needs. The absence of strong commitment from the communities in these two villages to making a sustainable effort to improve their economic conditions is also one of the supporting factors for

ineffective *Anggur Merah* program in the villages of Boronubaen and Hauteas. This is in line with the results of previous studies which show that the lack of commitment to the business affects the effectiveness of the implementation of the business and goals to be achieved (8, 20).

## CONCLUSIONS

This study reports several factors related to the implementation of the Red Wine program including active participation of the beneficiaries, socialization, communication, and understanding the rules and regulations related to the program. It also shows ineffectiveness of the implementation of the program due to several factors including the use of the budget for other needs, buying cows which are not in accordance to the standards, and early sale of the cows. The findings of the current study indicate that the implementation of the Red Wine program must be properly accompanied so that the beneficiaries conduct their business in accordance with established rules and procedures. This will help them to grow their business and return the capital assistance provided to them.

## REFERENCES

1. UNDP. Poverty in Focus. USA: United Nations Development Program 2006.
2. Chakravarty SR, Ravi K, Diganta M. Population Growth and Poverty Measurement. *Social Choice and Welfare*. 2006;26:471-83.
3. Sen AK. On Economic Inequality with a substantial annexe 'after a Quarter Century. USA: Oxford: Clarendon Oxford Press; 1997.
4. BPS Indonesia. Angka Kemiskinan di Indonesia. Jakarta: Badan Pusat Statistik 2017.
5. BPS NTT. Angka Kemiskinan di NTT. Kupang: Badan Pusat Statistik Propinsi Nusa Tenggara Timur 2017.
6. Pemerintah Propinsi Nusa Tenggara Timur. RPJMD NTT Province 2013-2018. Kupang: Pemerintah Propinsi Nusa Tenggara Timur 2012.
7. BPPD NTT. Program Pembangunan Desa/Kelurahan Mandiri Anggur Merah. Kupang: Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah Propinsi Nusa Tenggara Timur; 2013.
8. WHO. Community empowerment. 7th global conference on health promotion: track themes. Switzerland: World Health Organization, <http://www.who.int/healthpromotion/conferences/7gchp/track1/en2015>.

9. BPS TTU. Kependudukan. Kefamenanu: Badan Pusat Statistik Kabupaten Timor Tengah Utara 2017.
10. Creswell JW. Research, Kuantitatif Design Pendekatan Kualitatif, dan Mixed. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar; 2009.
11. Harrison L. Metodologi Penelitian Politik. Jakarta: Kencana; 2009.
12. Ritchie J, Spencer L. Qualitative data analysis for applied policy research. In: Bryman A, Burgess RG, editors. Analyzing Qualitative Data. London: Routledge; 1994. p. 173-94.
13. Fauk NK, Mwakinyali SE, Putra S, Mwanri L. Understanding the strategies employed to cope with increased numbers of AIDS orphaned children in families in rural settings: a case of Mbeya Rural District, Tanzania. *Infectious Diseases of Poverty*. 2017;6(21):1-10.
14. Fauk NK, Mwakinyali SE, Putra S, Mwanri L. The socio-economic impacts of Aids on families caring for Aids-orphaned children in Mbeya rural district, Tanzania. *International Journal of Human Rights in Healthcare*. 2017;10(2).
15. Fauk NK, Mwanri L. Inequalities in addressing the HIV epidemic: the story of the Indonesian Ojek Community. *Int J Hum Rights Healthcare*. 2015;8(8):1-34.
16. Durlak JA. Why Program Implementation is Important. *Journal of Prevention & Intervention in the Community*. 1998;17(2):5-18.
17. Lendrum A, Humphrey N. The importance of studying the implementation of interventions in school settings. *Oxford Review of Education*. 2012;38(5):635-52.
18. Pascual C, Escartí A, Llopis R, Gutiérrez M, Marín D, Wright PM. Implementation Fidelity of a Program Designed to Promote Personal and Social Responsibility Through Physical Education. *Research Quarterly for Exercise and Sport*. 2011;82(3):499-511.
19. Gajanayake S, Gajanayake J. Community Empowerment: A Participatory training manual on community project development. Dekalb, Illinois: Office of International Training and Consultation; 1993.
20. Rietbergen-McCracker J, Narayan D. Participation and Social Assessment: Tools and techniques. Washington D.C.: The World Bank; 1998.
21. UNHCS. Community Participation in Low-cost Sanitation. Nairobi: United Nations Centre for Human Settlement 1986.